

# Report on Tenders Received

Tenders for the Study on the Comparative Merits of Overhead Electricity Transmission Lines versus Underground Cables

This Request for Tenders was advertised on the eTenders website on 11th February 2008 with a closing date and time of 29<sup>th</sup> February 2008 at 12.00 noon.

Tenders were received from 4 applicants. A summary is given below.

Name of Company	Total Price Excluding VAT
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
Ecofys	€94,840
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]

A fifth envelope was received which contained what appeared to be an earlier draft of the proposal from Ecofys. The proposal was incomplete and there was only one copy, so this was not considered to be a tender proposal.

The following were present at the opening of the tenders:

Name	Title/Division
Karen Egan	EirGrid Corporate Division
Siobhan Judge	Gas & Peat Division

There were no Tenders rejected.

Signed  
 \_\_\_\_\_  
 Karen Egan  
 \_\_\_\_\_  
 Siobhan Judge

29 February 2008

**Karen Egan**

---

**From:** Karen Egan  
**Sent:** 29 February 2008 12:32  
**To:** Kilda Taylor  
**Subject:** FW: Extension of tender deadline  
**Follow Up Flag:** Follow up  
**Flag Status:** Completed

Kilda,  
Katherine has suggested meeting on Monday at 12 to open the tenders as the tender evaluation group will be meeting on Wednesday.  
Here are 5 tenders to open.

Karen Egan  
EirGrid (Corporate) Division

---

**From:** Karen Egan  
**Sent:** 29 February 2008 12:29  
**To:** Bob Hanna  
**Cc:** Kilda Taylor; Katherine Licken  
**Subject:** RE: Extension of tender deadline

Hi Bob,  
Katherine has agreed with Wednesday for the tender evaluation group meeting. I will try to have the valid proposals to you by Monday afternoon. Is that OK?

Karen  
  
Karen Egan  
EirGrid (Corporate) Division

---

**From:** Bob Hanna  
**Sent:** 29 February 2008 12:09  
**To:** Karen Egan  
**Subject:** RE: Extension of tender deadline

Karen,  
  
The tender evaluation group would need half a day for their meeting and also between half a day and a day free before then for each member to have studied the proposals after receiving them. My diary fills up some time in advance. I don't have that time available this week. The only day next week I would have available for a meeting would be Wednesday.

Regards,  
  
Bob

---

**From:** Karen Egan  
**Sent:** 29 February 2008 11:06  
**To:** Bob Hanna  
**Subject:** RE: Extension of tender deadline

Hi Bob,  
Monday or Tues of next week for the tender opening, depending on Kilda's availability. I will ask someone else from this division to be the third person for opening the tenders.  
I will be in touch with you about meeting to evaluate the tenders next week – I'm hoping that the tender evaluation group will meet on Wed or Thurs. If you could let me know your availability that would be helpful.

Thanks,  
Karen

Karen Egan  
EirGrid (Corporate) Division

---


**From:** Bob Hanna  
**Sent:** 29 February 2008 10:50  
**To:** Karen Egan  
**Subject:** RE: Extension of tender deadline

Karen,  
Did you decide when you were having your tender opening?

Regards,  
Bob

---

**From:** Karen Egan  
**Sent:** 27 February 2008 16:34  
**To:** Bob Hanna  
**Subject:** Extension of tender deadline

Hi Bob,  
 was on the phone to ask about extending the tender deadline. He is of the opinion that no one could produce a quality tender submission in the short space of time given. I told him that it was highly unlikely that the deadline would be extended but that I would raise the issue anyway. Katherine asked me to get your opinion on it.

Karen

Karen Egan  
EirGrid (Corporate) Division,  
Department of Communications, Energy  
and Natural Resources,  
9 - 31 Adelaide Road,  
Dublin 2

Ph: +353 1 6782278  
Fax: +353 1 6782969  
Email: [Karen.Egan@dcenr.gov.ie](mailto:Karen.Egan@dcenr.gov.ie)  
Web: [www.dcenr.gov.ie](http://www.dcenr.gov.ie)

04/06/2008

125



# BRINDLEY ADVERTISING

Brindley Advertising Ltd., Marine House, Clanwilliam Place, Dublin 2. Tel : 7753400, Fax : 6767577

**INVOICE GSM6679**

VAT No 8F54264F

Department of Communications, Energy  
& Natural Resources,  
Oil Supply, Oil, Gas, Grid & Peat Corporate Division,  
29-31 Adelaide Road,  
Dublin 2.

29th February 2008

For the attention of Ms Katherine Licken

## Study on Transmission Line Infrastructure

Feb 13	21cm x 3cols	Irish Independent	4,599.00	
Feb 13	21cm x 3cols	Irish Times	4,189.50	
Feb 13	21cm x 3cols	Irish Examiner	2,646.00	
Feb 13	21cm x 3cols	The Star	4,266.99	
Feb 13	21cm x 3cols	Irish Farmer's Journal	3,087.00	
Feb 17	8" x 3cols	Foinse	<u>1,080.00</u>	
			19,868.49	
		Less 46.25% rebate as per contract	<u>9,189.18</u>	
				10,679.31
Feb 13	21cm x 3cols	Daily Mail	3,241.35	
Feb 13	21cm x 3cols	The Sun	2,580.00	
Feb 14	21cm x 3cols	Daily Mirror	<u>1,764.00</u>	
				<u>7,585.35</u>
				18,264.66
		VAT @ 21%		<u>3,835.58</u>
				22,100.24

Dispatch no: 70018026

Department of Communications,  
Energy and Natural Resources

An Roinn Cumarsáide, Fuinnimh  
agus Acmhainní Náúrtha

Phone: +353 1 6782000



Oil Supply Division  
29-31 Adelaide Road  
Dublin 2

Phone: + 353 1 6782971  
Fax: + 353 1 6782969

**PURCHASE ORDER**

Brindley Advertising Ltd.  
Brindley Advertising Ltd.  
Marine House,  
Clanwilliam Place,  
Dublin 2  
Ireland

**ORDÚ CEANNACHÁIN**

Order No. \ Uimh Ord. 20015700  
Supplier ID \ 1199  
Uimh. Aitheantais Soláthraí  
Order Date \ Dáta Ordaithe 11/04/2008  
Contact \ Teagmhálaí  
Page \ Leathanach 1 of 1

**DELIVERY ADDRESS \ SEOLADH SEACHADTA:**

Oil Supply Division  
29-31 Adelaide Road  
Dublin 2  
Ireland

**INVOICE ADDRESS \ SEOLADH SONRAISC:**

Accounts Branch  
Department of Communication,  
Energy & Natural Resources  
Elm House  
Co Cavan  
Ireland

PRODUCT TÁIRGE	DESCRIPTION SONRAÍ	QTY MÉID	UNIT AONAD	PRICE COSTAS	DISCOUNT LASCÁINE	AMOUNT EUR SUIM EUR
170101	Consultancy Services (non IT) Advertising related to Transmission Lines Study (Eirgrid) - €18,264.66+VAT@21% (€3,835.58)= Total €22,100.24	1.00	EA	18,264.6600	0.00	18,264.66

Total	18,264.66
Total VAT	3,835.58
<b>Total Amount in EUR</b>	<b>22,100.24</b>

ORDER NUMBER MUST BE QUOTED ON ALL DELIVERY DOCKETS & INVOICES

CAITHFEAR AN UIMHER ORDÁITHE A LUA AR GACH DUILLÍN SEACHADTA AGUS SONRASC

56

**Karen Egan**

**From:** Bob Hanna  
**Sent:** 27 February 2008 17:24  
**To:** Karen Egan  
**Subject:** RE: Extension of tender deadline

aren,

/e are under a Ministerial imperative to do this as quickly as we can.

is possible to submit a valid tender in the time available and I do not recommend that we extend the deadline.

egards,

ob

---

**From:** Karen Egan  
**en:** 27 February 2008 16:34  
**o:** Bob Hanna  
**ubject:** Extension of tender deadline

i Bob,

[REDACTED] was on the phone to ask about extending the tender deadline. He is of the opinion that no one would produce a quality tender submission in the short space of time given. I told him that it was highly unlikely that the deadline would be extended but that I would raise the issue anyway. Katherine asked me to get your opinion on it.

aren

Karen Egan  
 rGrid (Corporate) Division,  
 Department of Communications, Energy  
 and Natural Resources,  
 1 - 31 Adelaide Road,  
 Dublin 2

tel: +353 1 6782278  
 fax: +353 1 6782969  
 email: Karen.Egan@dcenr.gov.ie  
 web: www.dcenr.gov.ie

120

point or law arose in the case requiring determination by the Supreme Court, a decision which effectively clears the way for a full appeal to the Supreme Court.

The five-judge Supreme Court, comprising the Chief Justice, Mr Justice John Murray, Mr Justice Susan Denham, Mr Justice Adrian Hardiman, Mr Justice Hugh Geoghegan and Mr Justice Nial Fennelly, began hearing that appeal amid tight security yesterday. McKevitt, who boycotted his original trial for some time, was in court.

He was the first person to be convicted in the State for the offence of directing terrorism, which was introduced after the Real IRA bomb attack in Omagh

informers.

Mr Rupert was described in a report by an American state trooper as being involved, using a trucking firm set up by him, in theft and people/arms smuggling between the US and Canada. Mr Hartnett said.

His failure to be prosecuted for these activities and his later being signed up by the FBI were relevant to the integrity of his motivation for giving evidence in the case against McKevitt, Mr Hartnett said.

No schedule of documentation was ever presented to the defence and McKevitt's lawyers got material relating to Mr Rupert's alleged criminality by chance or mistake.

O'Meara, Clonsilla, Clonsilla Close, Clonsilla, Dublin, pleaded guilty to concealing a court's summons addressed to Behan and entering into an agreement to pervert the course of justice by preventing charges being processed correctly between May 27th and July 30th, 2004, at Aras Uí Dhálaigh, Inns Quay, Dublin.

Behan, Moylaragh View, Balbriggan, Co Dublin pleaded guilty to two counts of attempting to pervert the course of justice by entering an agreement to interfere with summons on dates between December 17th, 2003, and July 30th, 2004.

Judge Katherine Delahunt said Behan and O'Meara "corrupted

57  
the "funds would be by his children" and accept the cheque into

The court heard was stopped by December 2003 when him driving in an RTÉ. He was arrested and road traffic offences drunk driving were p

Garda Alan McDe to the summons off summons issued for Court in relation to ces. When the case w the District Court in I transpired that the court record of the st the case did not go on Gardai applied for

## DEPARTMENT OF COMMUNICATIONS, ENERGY AND NATURAL RESOURCES

ROINN CUMARSÁIDE, FUINNIMH  
AGUS ACMHAINNÍ NÁDÚRTHA

The Department of Communications, Energy and Natural Resources is currently commissioning an independent study on the comparative merits of overhead electricity transmission lines versus underground cables.

Members of the public or interested parties may make submissions to the Department on issues relevant to this study. The consultants appointed to undertake the study will be asked to review such submissions and to take account of these as appropriate in their final report. Submissions can be made to the following address:

**Study on Transmission Line Infrastructure,  
Energy Division,**

**Department of Communications,  
Energy and Natural Resources,  
29 - 31 Adelaide Road,  
Dublin 2.**

**Email: [Study@dcenr.ie](mailto:Study@dcenr.ie)**

**The deadline for receipt of submissions is  
17.00 hours on Friday 7th March 2008.**

## HSE case helps on lawyers says ju

A legal action to assess or not HSE property for rates involves money going round in the expense of the High Court judge in conduct of the case was only to lawyers, Mr J Kelly added.

He made the real making directions exchange of legal documents preparation for the case in the Commercial May 6th next.

The proceedings decision of the Valuation Tribunal of March 2007 property in Limerick for rates. The HSE the tribunal's decision Limerick property should as a test case for all rates.

However, the Valuation Tribunal last June HSE must appeal at rates individually as they benefit from the Limerick case.

The HSE has challenged the decision and the Tribunal will determine points of law due for hearing in March.

## Jury ac

A Dublin man who in a fight to protect been acquitted of the father of two by a jury at the Criminal Court.

The jury of seven five men took just hours to find Pete Tullip Court Darnley of murdering Ray during a disturbance at Clonsilla Drive in Co Dublin 2nd 2005.

58

**Karen Egan**

---

**From:** Karen Egan  
**Sent:** 26 February 2008 17:14  
**To:** Bob Hanna  
**Cc:** Kilda Taylor  
**Subject:** RE: Study on Transmission lines

Thanks Bob, I will ask somebody from the division in that case, and get back to you later in the week about setting up the tender evaluation group.  
aren

aren Egan  
irGrid (Corporate) Division

---

**From:** Bob Hanna  
**Sent:** 26 February 2008 17:11  
**To:** Karen Egan  
**Subject:** RE: Study on Transmission lines

Hi Karen,

I'm not here at all on Monday, and only have between 11.00 and 1.00 on Tuesday available, so it could be then.

However, you don't need me for this – Kilda plus one other from your Division would be OK, so you could do this on Monday. You just need to log them (who and how much) and check for administrative compliance with the invitation to tender – there's no actual evaluation necessary at that stage. We only evaluate those tenders which pass administrative compliance.

Bob

---

**From:** Karen Egan  
**Sent:** 26 February 2008 14:55  
**To:** Bob Hanna  
**Subject:** Study on Transmission lines

Hi E

Would you be available sometime next Monday or Tuesday to open the tenders for the Study on Transmission lines?

aren Egan  
irGrid (Corporate) Division

8/05/2008

59

**Karen Egan**

**From:** Kilda Taylor  
**Sent:** 26 February 2008 13:03  
**To:** Karen Egan  
**Subject:** RE: tenders

[REDACTED] afternoon, and I don't know if I will be required or not.

Bob is the obvious third person, so we should ask him and fit in with his schedule.

Please make sure you talk to Kevin about all other aspects of the process – I think you have to get Jim to write in the time the tenders are received etc. so he will need to be alerted in good time.

You will also need to deal with the whole assessment process, from devising a marking scheme, arranging a meeting to assess the valid bids, recording the assessment process and dealing with notifying successful and unsuccessful bidders. There may also be a need to request the short-listed tenderers to make a presentation following the initial assessment. Then there will be the drawing up and awarding of the contract, the inception meeting, and any subsequent meetings with the successful bidder.

*Kilda Taylor  
 Assistant Principal  
 Civil Supply/EirGrid (Corporate) Division  
 Department of Communications, Energy and Natural Resources  
 Adelaide Road  
 Dublin 2*

t. 6782962

**From:** Karen Egan  
**Sent:** 26 February 2008 12:32  
**To:** Kilda Taylor  
**Subject:** RE: tenders

Ida,  
 I propose to open the tenders on Monday afternoon at 3pm – is this time OK for you?  
 We will also need a third person who is independent. Can we use someone from the division or do they have to be from outside our own division?

Karen Egan  
 EirGrid (Corporate) Division

**From:** Kilda Taylor  
**Sent:** 26 February 2008 12:27  
**To:** Karen Egan  
**Subject:** tenders

Karen

We have talked to Bob and Katherine and both agree that we shouldn't give any details of the price range we are envisaging for the tender. You need just say to them that it is a competitive process, and it is a matter for tenderers to make bids on the basis of the terms of reference. You could say that they will be aware that the value of the tender falls below the threshold for advertising in the EU journal (whatever it's called!), but that is all we can say.

You will need to arrange for the opening of the tenders, alerting Jim at Reception to receive them etc. – Kevin has just

27/05/2008

een through this process for the oil consultancy tender, so he can advise you about the process.

egards

*Hilda Taylor*  
*Assistant Principal*  
*Oil Supply/EirGrid (Corporate) Division*  
*Department of Communications, Energy and Natural Resources*  
*Deloitte Road*  
*Dublin 2*

h. 6782962

**Karen Egan**

---

**From:** Karen Egan  
**Sent:** 26 February 2008 12:37  
**To:** 'Karsten Burges'  
**Cc:** Kilda Taylor; Katherine Licken  
**Subject:** RE: Tender on Overhead Electricity Transmission Lines versus Underground Cables, update on telephone conversation yesterday evening

Karsten,

is tender is a competitive process, and it is therefore a matter for tenderers to make bids on the basis of the terms of  
ference.

you are probably aware, the value of the tender falls below the threshold for advertising in the OJEU, but that is all the  
ormation I can give you at this point.

nd Regards,

iren Egan  
Grid (Corporate) Division

---

**om:** Karsten Burges [mailto:K.Burges@ecofys.de]  
**nt:** 26 February 2008 10:53  
**:** Karen Egan  
**bject:** Tender on Overhead Electricity Transmission Lines versus Underground Cables, update on telephone  
nversation yesterday evening

ar Karen,  
sterday I raised the question of the budget for the study considered being appropriate by the Department of  
mmunications, Energy and Natural Resources.

mentioned - with the level of detail we have in mind offering to the client - our budget estimate would be slightly less  
[redacted] (except the additional work for incorporating the submissions). If you, after consultation with the  
If you are in charge, indicate that this is substantially more than the Department intends to allocate to this study, such  
ormation would help us to adjust our proposals structure and approach to your needs.

oking forward to your reply,

sten Burges  
anager Power Systems and Markets  
ofys Germany GmbH (Berlin)  
+49-30-2977 3579 10  
+49-174-929 5279

---

ensitz: Köln | Geschäftsleitung: Carsten Petersdorff | Amtsgericht Köln: HRB 28527

mission: a sustainable energy supply for everyone  
**and the international Ecofys Newsletter!**  
\*\*\*\*\*